IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA SOUTHERN DIVISION

)
IN RE: BLUE CROSS) Master File No. 2:13-CV-20000-RDP
BLUE SHIELD)
ANTITRUST LITIGATION) This document relates to Provider Track Cases
(MDL NO. 2406))
)

PROVIDER PLAINTIFFS' EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF EXPERT DECLARATIONS OF DANIEL SLOTTJE AND BRENDAN ROGERS AND MATTHEW C. KATZ

Providers today filed two expert declarations regarding the benefits and value of the injunctive relief provided by the Preliminarily Approved Provider Settlement. Professor Daniel Slottje and Brendan Rogers of Analysis Group provide a declaration, which based on information from the Blues and the work of Matthew Katz (discussed below), finds a valuation of over \$17.3 billion for certain aspects of the injunctive relief. Slottje and Rogers found the valuation of the administrative cost savings to Providers from just these aspects of the relief had an average value of \$7.55 for each BlueCard claim. Mr. Katz's expert declaration makes clear that the business practice changes by the Blues, and the injunctive relief provided by the Settlement, would provide extraordinary value to Providers in reduced time and expense pursuing BlueCard claims and that the injunctive relief in this Settlement will also be incredibly valuable and beneficial to those Providers' patients.

I. Slottje/Rogers Declaration

Professor Daniel Slottje and Brendan Rogers of Analysis Group have worked on this litigation for years and have provided a declaration regarding the valuation of certain aspects of the injunctive relief. Professor Slottje's credentials are extraordinary. He is a Professor Emeritus of Economics at Southern Methodist University in Dallas, Texas, where he has taught classes on

price theory, econometrics, industrial organization and antitrust economics. He is a Senior Advisor at Analysis Group, a global business advisory firm. Professor Slottje has provided consulting services to clients in various industries for over 30 years including in providing litigation consulting services to clients in the healthcare industry. He has consulted and testified on healthcare litigation matters on topics such as class certification issues, the statistical reliability of the health insurance claims adjudication process with respect to under-reimbursement issues, the statistical reliability of health insurance claims databases, and antitrust issues in the healthcare industry. Further, Professor Slottje has extensive experience working with some of the largest health claims data and has extraordinary expertise in health insurance systems. His multi-year work on that case, as well as others, has provided Professor Slottje with extraordinary insight into the world of healthcare claims data, edits and extrapolation.

Mr. Rogers has for the last 20 years worked on matters of calculation of valuation of damages and relief in all aspects of litigation including, antitrust, competition, contractual disputes and intellectual property. Mr. Rogers' litigation experience has included class actions in health care that involve analysis of large datasets related to class-wide liability and damages claims. Both Professor Slottje and Mr. Rogers have also worked on this case for more than 10 years and are intimately familiar with the Blues' system, the documents and data produced in this case, and with the relief provided by the Settlement.

Professor Slottje and Mr. Rogers' opinions are summarized below:

1. Professor Slottje and Mr. Rogers were asked to value two important aspects of the Settlement's injunctive relief – the expected cost savings to Providers from spending less time on BlueCard Program-related administrative tasks and the expected financial benefit from the

BlueCard Prompt Pay Commitment. As outlined in Table 1 below, the value of these aspects of the injunctive relief totals to **over \$17.3 billion** dollars over the next ten years.

Table 1
Providers' Expected Financial Benefit from Blue System Improvements¹

Financial Benefit (in \$ billions)	Value	Net Present Value
Ten Year Administrative Cost Savings	\$16.31	\$11.64
Fewer BlueCard Claims Require Follow Up	\$4.04	\$2.88
Less Time Spent on BlueCard Claim Follow Up	\$8.66	\$6.18
Less Time Spent on BlueCard Claim Pre-Submission Tasks	\$3.62	\$2.58
Five Year BlueCard Prompt Pay Commitment	\$1.05	\$0.89
Total	\$17.36	\$12.53

- 2. In determining the value of just the administrative savings from the BlueCard relief provided by the Settlement, Slottje and Rogers relied upon Blues' internal documents and studies, claims data produced in the litigation, and the opinions of expert Matthew Katz, to arrive at these figures.
- 3. Slottje and Rogers valued the following administrative savings that will be available to Providers through the BlueCard Transformation and related injunctive relief:
 - a. Fewer BlueCard claims requiring follow-up;
 - Less provider time spent on BlueCard Claim follow up on claims requiring follow up; and
 - c. Less time Spent on BlueCard Claim Pre-Submission Tasks.

-

See Exhibits 1-4.

- 4. Slottje and Rogers found an average administrative cost savings for Providers of \$7.55 per BlueCard claim. The actual administrative savings per BlueCard claim would differ by Provider claim. (¶29)
- 5. Slottje and Rogers found the BlueCard Prompt Pay Commitment would provide another **\$1.05** billion in value to Providers over the next 10 years.
- 6. There is extraordinary value to other aspects of the Settlement (¶37-38) that Professor Slottje and Rogers were not asked to value as part of their assignment. For instance, while it was not part of their assignment, there is likely a significant revenue increase to healthcare providers available from the increased ability for Providers to identify, track, pursue (including through the new BlueCard appeal form) and collect on denied BlueCard claims. The total value of the injunctive relief in this Settlement is likely far more than \$17.3 billion dollars.

II. Katz Declaration

Matthew Katz is one of the leading experts in the country on issues related to healthcare practice management, billing, coding prompt payment and other issues. Mr. Katz is a Principal at MCK Health Strategies and MCK Consulting, LLC, where he advises state and national medical specialty societies, and works with hospitals, health systems, physician practices, and other clinicians on issues related to medical practice management, coding, claims processing, adjudication and payment dispute issues. Since 1994, Mr. Katz has worked in the healthcare industry, first for academic medical centers, health systems, and then with the American Academy of Pediatrics. For 8 years, he worked for the American Medical Association, including as the Director of the Practice Management Resource Center and Director of Private Payer Advocacy. From 2006-2019, he worked for the Connecticut State Medical Society, including as its CEO from 2012-2019. Mr. Katz is well held by his colleagues in the industry as one of the most

knowledgeable people regarding insurer-provider payment issues nationally and is routinely sought out for advice on these issues by state medical associations and other clients. Long before this litigation, Mr. Katz was an expert on issues related to the BlueCard program, the Blues system generally, and the administrative burdens related to the provision of care and services to Blue members.

Mr. Katz's opinions regarding the value and benefits of the Settlement are summarized below:

- 1. The BlueCard Transformation and other injunctive relief will result in significant administrative savings for Providers from less or quicker follow up on BlueCard claims. Mr. Katz also found significant value to Providers from quicker eligibility verification and pre-authorization built into the injunctive relief. If implemented as intended, the improvements to the BlueCard system should reduce the administrative burden associated with BlueCard claims to a level comparable with non-BlueCard claims. (¶¶10, 12-27). Mr. Katz specifically found:
 - a. Using the current BlueCard process often used considerable time for Providers and their staff. Reduction of the amount of time it takes to follow up and the number of follow ups can lead to significant cost savings for Providers. The relief here would reduce the amount of time needed by providers to follow up on these claims.
 - b. The current BlueCard process also requires that Providers follow up numerous times. Mr. Katz concludes that the injunctive relief in the Settlement would reduce the number of claims upon which Providers would be required to follow up.
 - c. There are significant administrative savings from the quicker eligibility and verification and preauthorization on BlueCard claims that the Injunctive relief provides. Currently, approximately 60-80 percent of BlueCard claims require the Provider to verify

the members' eligibility. This process is more time-consuming for BlueCard claims than for local claims. The relief in the settlement will provide tremendous value to provider if it reduces the time to a level comparable with local claims.

- 2. Beyond administrative savings, Mr. Katz found other sources of value to the Settlement Class Members including:
 - a. The Settlement Relief will cause Providers to collect more on BlueCard claims. Lack of timely payment, or no payment at all, costs Providers significant income and costs to pursue these dollars. ¶23
 - b. BlueCard Executive and the resolution mechanisms created by the Settlement reduce the need for costly legal and administrative interventions. ¶24
 - c. Real Time Messaging provides significant time saving and cost-benefits to Providers. $\P 25$
 - d. Beyond the improvements to pre-authorization due to BlueCard Transformation, the Blues commitment to provide guidance on pre-authorization to member plans to improve preauthorization is likely to reduce administrative burden Providers. ¶26
- 3. The Settlement's injunctive relief will not only benefit the members of the Settlement Class who do not opt-out, it will benefit their patients. If a Provider opts-out of this settlement, its patients obviously will not receive the benefits of the settlement. If Providers participate in the Settlement, their patients will benefit by significant improvements, including but not limited to:
 - a. The Settlement significantly improves pre-authorization for BlueCard claims. Pre-authorization processes resulting in a process that will streamline the pre-

authorization process, making it cleared for providers and patients, and insure that procedures and claims are less likely to be delayed or denied for administrative reasons.

- b. More timely and accurate claims processing and adjudication, reducing the financial burden on patients.
- c. Reduction of administrative burden on providers means they can devote more time to their patients and their treatment.
 - d. Increased access to telehealth is beneficial for many patients.
- e. Real-time messaging reduces BlueCard related delays to access to necessary treatments and or other disputes and delays that affect patients.
- f. New requirements with respect to prompt payment and third-party information also benefit patients as well.

Respectfully submitted the 31st day of January, 2025.

/s/ Edith M. Kallas

Edith M. Kallas – *Co-Lead Counsel*WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP
152 West 57th Street
41st Floor

New York, NY 10019 Tel: (212) 447-7060 Fax: (800) 922-4851

Email: ekallas@whatleykallas.com

/s/ Joe R. Whatley, Jr.

Joe R. Whatley, Jr. – Co-Lead Counsel

W. Tucker Brown

WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP

2001 Park Place North 1000 Park Place Tower Birmingham, AL 35203

Tel: (205) 488-1200 Fax: (800) 922-4851

Email: jwhatley@whatleykallas.com tbrown@whatleykallas.com

Patrick J. Sheehan

WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP

101 Federal Street

19th Floor

Boston, MA 10019 Tel: (617) 573-5118 Fax: (617) 371-2950

Email: psheehan@whatleykallas.com

Henry C. Quillen

WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP

159 Middle Street

Suite 2C

Portsmouth, NH 03801 Tel: (603) 294-1591

Fax: (800) 922-4851

Email: hquillen@whatleykallas.com

Barry Alan Ragsdale – *Plaintiffs' Liaison*

Deborah J. Winegard

Counsel and Discovery Liaison Counsel

Dominick Feld Hyde, PC

1130 22nd Street South Ridge Park

Suite 4000

Birmingham, AL 35205

Tel: (205) 536-8888

bragsdale@dfhlaw.com

Charles Clinton Hunter HAYES HUNTER PC

4265 San Felipe, Suite 1000

Houston, TX 77027 Tel: (281) 768-4731 Fax: (713) 583-7047

Email: chunter@hayeshunterlaw.com

Dennis Pantazis – *Plaintiffs' Steering Committee*

Brian Clark – *Discovery Committee* WIGGINS CHILDS PANTAZIS FISHER

GOLDFARB

The Kress Building

301 Nineteenth Street North Birmingham, AL 35203

Tel: (205) 314-0500 Fax: (205) 254-1500

Email: dgp@wigginschilds.com bclark@wigginschilds.com

Dennis C. Reich - Chair, Damages Committee

REICH & BINSTOCK, LLP

4265 San Felipe, Suite 1000

Houston, TX 77027 Tel: (713) 622-7271 Fax: (713) 623-8724

Email: dreich@reichandbinstock.com

Nicholas B. Roth – *Chair, Discovery Committee*

Julia Smeds Roth – *Discovery Committee* EYSTER KEY TUBB ROTH MIDDLETON

& ADAMS, LLP

402 East Moulton Street, SE

Decatur, AL 35602

Tel: (256) 353-6761

WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP

1068 Virginia Avenue, NE

Atlanta, GA 30306 Tel: (404) 607-8222 Fax: (404) 607-8451

Email: dwinegard@whatleykallas.com

E. Kirk Wood, Jr. - Local Facilitating

Counsel

WOOD LAW FIRM LLC

P. O. Box 382434 Birmingham, AL 35238 Tel: (205) 612-0243

Fax: (205) 705-1223

Email: kirk@woodlawfirmllc.com

Aaron S. Podhurst – *Plaintiffs' Steering Committee*

Peter Prieto – Chair, Expert Committee

PODHURST ORSECK, P.A.

One S.E. 3rd Avenue

Suite 2300

Miami, FL 33131 Tel: (305) 358-2800

Fax: (305) 358-2382

Email: apodhurst@podhurst.com pprieto@podhurst.com

U.W. Clemon – *Plaintiffs' Steering Committee*

U. W. Clemon, LLC

5202 Mountain Ridge Parkway

Birmingham, AL 35222 Tel: (205) 837-2898

Email: uwclemon1@gmail.com

J. Mark White – *Litigation Committee* Augusta S. Dowd – *Chair, Litigation Committee*

Linda G. Flippo – *Discovery Committee* WHITE ARNOLD & DOWD, P.C.

2001 Park Place North

Suite 1400

Birmingham, AL 35203

Fax: (256) 353-6767

Email: nbroth@eysterkeylaw.com

jroth@eysterkeylaw.com

Tel: (205) 323-1888 Fax: (205) 323-8907

Email: mwhite@whitearnolddowd.com

adowd@whitearnolddowd.com lflippo@whitearnolddowd.com

David A. Balto - Expert Committee

THE LAW OFFICES OF DAVID A. BALTO

1350 I Street, N.W., Suite 850

Washington, DC 20005 Tel: (202) 789-5424

Fax: (202) 589-1819

Email: david.balto@dcantitrustlaw.com

Van Bunch - Chair, Class Certification **Committee**

BONNETT FAIRBOURN FRIEDMAN &

BALINT, P.C.

2325 E. Camelback Road, Suite 300

Phoenix, AZ 85016 Tel: (602) 274-1100 Fax: (602) 274-1199

Email: vbunch@bffb.com

Joey K. James - Litigation Committee

BUNCH & JAMES P. O. Box 878

Florence, AL 35631

Tel: (256) 764-0095 Fax: (256) 767-5705

Email: joey@joeyjameslaw.com

Robert J. Axelrod - Chair, Written

Submissions Committee

AXELROD LLP

800 Third Avenue, Suite 2800

New York, NY 10022 Tel: (646) 448-5263 Fax: (212) 840-8560

Email: raxelrod39@gmail.com

Richard S. Frankowski – Discovery Committee THE FRANKOWSKI FIRM, LLC

231 22nd Street South, Suite 203

Birmingham, AL 35233 Tel: (205) 390-0399 Fax: (205) 390-1001

Email: richard@frankowskifirm.com

W. Daniel Miles, III - Written Submissions

Committee

BEASLEY ALLEN CROW METHVIN

PORTIS

& MILES, P.C. 218 Commerce Street Montgomery, AL 36104

Tel: (800) 898-2034 Fax: (334) 954-7555

Email: dee.miles@beasleyallen.com

John C. Davis – Written Submissions

Committee

LAW OFFICE OF JOHN C. DAVIS

623 Beard Street Tallahassee, FL 32303 Tel: (850) 222-4770

Email: john@johndavislaw.net

Michael C. Dodge – *Expert Committee* GLAST PHILLIPS & MURRAY, P.C.

14801 Quorum Drive, Suite 500 Dallas, TX 75254

Tel: (972) 419-7172

Email: mdodge@gpm-law.com

Mark K. Gray – *Discovery Committee*

GRAY & WHITE

713 E. Market Street, Suite 200

Louisville, KY 40202 Tel: (502) 805-1800 Fax: (502) 618-4059

Email: mgray@grayandwhitelaw.com

Stephen M. Hansen – *Class Certification Committee*

LAW OFFICE OF STEPHEN M. HANSEN

1821 Dock Street Tacoma, WA 98402 Tel: (253) 302-5955 Fax: (253) 301-1147

Email: steve@stephenmhansenlaw.com

Harley S. Tropin – *Damages Committee* Javier A. Lopez – *Discovery Committee* KOZYAK TROPIN &

THROCKMORTON, P.A.

2525 Ponce De Leon Boulevard, 9th Floor

Miami, FL 33134 Tel: (305) 372-1800 Fax: (305) 372-3508 Email: hst@kttlaw.com jal@kttlaw.com

C. Wes Pittman – Settlement Committee

THE PITTMAN FIRM, P.A. 432 McKenzie Avenue

Panama City, FL 32401 Tel: (850) 784-9000 Fax: (850) 763-6787

Email: wes@pittmanfirm.com

Robert B. Roden - Litigation Committee

SHELBY RODEN, LLC 2956 Rhodes Circle Birmingham, AL 35205 Tel: (205) 933-8383 Fax: (205) 933-8386

Email: rroden@shelbyroden.com

Michael E. Gurley, Jr. – *Discovery Committee*

Attorney at Law

24108 Portobello Road Birmingham, AL 35242 Tel: (205) 908-6512

Email: mgurleyjr@yahoo.com

Lynn W. Jinks, III – *Expert Committee* Christina D. Crow – *Discovery Committee*

JINKS CROW, P.C. 219 North Prairie Street Union Springs, AL 36089

Tel: (334) 738-4225 Fax: (334) 738-4229

Email: ljinks@jinkslaw.com ccrow@jinkslaw.com

Myron C. Penn – *Discovery Committee*

PENN & SEABORN, LLC

53 Highway 110 Post Office Box 5335 Union Springs, AL 36089 Tel: (334) 738-4486

Tel: (334) 738-4486 Fax: (334) 738-4432

Email: myronpenn28@hotmail.com

J. Preston Strom, Jr. - Litigation Committee

STROM LAW FIRM, LLC

2110 N. Beltline Boulevard, Suite A

Columbia, SC 29204-3905

Tel: (803) 252-4800 Fax: (803) 252-4801

Email: petestrom@stromlaw.com

Thomas V. Bender – Discovery Committee

Dirk L. Hubbard

HORN AYLWARD & BANDY, LLC

2600 Grand Blvd., Suite 1100 Kansas City, MO 64108 Tel: (816) 421-0700

Email: tbender@hab-law.com dhubbard@hab-law.com

Gary E. Mason – Class Certification Committee

WHITFIELD BRYSON & MASON, LLP 1625 Massachusetts Ave. NW, Suite 605

Washington, DC 20036 Tel: (202) 429-2290 Fax: (202) 640-1160

Email: gmason@wbmllp.com

Michael L. Murphy – *Discovery Committee*

BAILEY GLASSER LLP 910 17th Street, NW, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20006

Tel: (202) 463-2101 Fax: (202) 463-2103

Email: mmurphy@baileyglasser.com

Lance Michael Sears SEARS & SWANSON, P.C.

First Bank Building

2 North Cascade Avenue, Suite 1250

Colorado Springs, CO 80903

Tel: (719) 471-1984 Fax: (719) 577-4356

Email: lance@searsassociates.com

Jessica Dillon Ray R. Brown Molly Brown

DILLON & FINDLEY, P.C. 1049 W. 5th Avenue, Suite 200

Anchorage, AK 99501 Tel: (907) 277-5400 Fax: (907) 277-9896

Email: Jessica@dillonfindley.com

Ray@dillonfindley.com Molly@dillonfindley.com Gregory S. Cusimano – *Litigation Committee* CUSIMANO, ROBERTS & MILLS, LLC

153 South 9th Street Gadsden, AL 35901 Phone: (256) 543-0400 Fax: (256) 543-0488

Email: greg@alalawyers.net

Brian E. Wojtalewicz

WOJTALEWICZ LAW FIRM, LTD.

139 N. Miles Street Appleton, MN 56208 Tel: (320) 289-2363 Fax: (320) 289-2369

Email: brian@wojtalewiczlawfirm.com

Archie C. Lamb, Jr.

ARCHIE LAMB & ASSOCIATES, LLC

301 19th Street North, Suite 585

The Kress Bldg.

Birmingham, AL 35203-3145

(205) 458-1210

Email: alamb@archielamb.com

Paul Lundberg

LUNDBERG LAW, PLC 600 4TH Street, Suite 906 Sioux City, IA 51101

Tel: (712) 234-3030 Fax: (712) 234-3034

Email: paul@lundberglawfirm.com

Allyson C. Dirksen HEIDMAN LAW FIRM, P.L.L.C. 1128 Historic 4th Street P. O. Box 3086 Sioux City, IA 51101 Tel: (712) 255-8838

Fax (712) 258-6714

Email: allyson.dirksen@heidmanlaw.com

Gwen Simons Simons & Associates Law, P.A. P.O. Box 1238 Scarborough, ME 04070-1238

Tel: (207) 205-2045 Fax: (207) 883-7225

Email: gwen@simonsassociateslaw.com

Counsel for Provider Plaintiffs